

Buddhist Manuscripts from Central Asia: The British Library Sanskrit Fragments, vol. II. Edited by SEISHI KARASHIMA and KLAUS WILLE. Tokyo: INTERNATIONAL RESEARCH INSTITUTE FOR ADVANCED BUDDHOLOGY, 2009. Vol. II.1: pp. 668. Vol. II.2: 382 plates.

The British scholar Rudolf Hoernle (1841–1918) began the study of Central Asian manuscript fragments—sent to him by British agents in Central Asia by arrangement with the Government of India—in 1895 when he served as principal of the Mohammedan College of Calcutta (the “Calcutta Madrasah”). The manuscripts, hailing from various sites around Khotan on the southern branch of the Silk Road and around Kucha on the northern branch, were primarily written in Brāhmī script and in the Sanskrit, Khotanese, Tumshuqese, and Tocharian languages. After his retirement to Oxford in 1902, Hoernle continued to receive and study manuscript consignments from Central Asia, as he prepared his epoch-making publication *Manuscript Remains of Buddhist Literature Found in Eastern Turkestan* (1916).

The book under review publishes—in most cases for the first time—Sanskrit and Tocharian fragments from Hoernle’s collection (now part of the British Library’s Asia, Pacific and Africa Collections) that were not included in *Manuscript Remains*. It is the second part of a series established by Seishi Karashima and Klaus Wille in 2006, the first of which (reviewed by Richard Salomon in *JAOS* 128: 809) presented Sanskrit and Tocharian fragments from the British Library’s Hoernle and Stein collections. *BLSF* II comes in two volumes; the text volume is simultaneously available in PDF format from the website of the International Research Institute for Advanced Buddhism at Soka University (http://iriab.soka.ac.jp/orc/Publications/BLSF/index_BLSF.html), while images of the fragments and some (but not all) transliterations can be accessed individually in the International Dunhuang Project’s database (<http://idp.bl.uk/>). This is a change of procedure from *BLSF* I, the images of which were simultaneously published on the IDP and IRIAB websites, but the combination of the *BLSF* II text volume and the IDP’s presentation of the raw data is very convenient indeed. It is only to be regretted that parts of the PDF version of the text volume are not searchable, an oversight that should be easy to correct.

The volume contains an introductory essay by Ursula Sims-Williams on the history of the Hoernle manuscripts after their deposit in the British Museum and India Office Library (picking up the story from her essay on Hoernle’s papers in *BLSF* I); a survey of Buddhist Sanskrit manuscript finds from Khotan by Klaus Wille, including editions of pressmark Or.15001 (fragments purchased in the Khotan bazar) and of the *Prātimokṣasūtra* manuscripts in the Crosby collection (found in Khadaliq east of Khotan); an edition by the same author of the Sanskrit fragments in pressmark Or.15004 (almost all from the northern Silk Road); an edition of approximately half of the Sanskrit fragments in pressmark Or.15009 by Ye Shaoyong, Jundo Nagashima, Jiro Hirabayashi, Noriyuki Kudo, Gudrun Melzer, and Takamichi Fukita (from the Khotan and Kucha areas; the second half of this press mark is scheduled to be published in *BLSF* III); and an edition of the Sanskrit fragments in pressmark Or.15010 by Seishi Karashima (from the Khotan and Kucha areas).

It also contains separate editions of fragments of four Mahāyāna sūtras in these pressmarks by experts on the respective texts, uniting them with fragments of the same folios from other collections. Hiromi Habata’s edition of the *Mahāparinirvāṇamahāsūtra* adds new material to her 2007 partial edition of the Sanskrit remains of this text, and the numbering of her contribution suggests that a further installment is forthcoming in a future *BLSF* volume. Jens-Uwe Hartmann and Chanwit Tudkeao’s edition of the *Ratnaketu-parivarta* presents three fragments from three separate manuscripts; the text of one of these fragments was previously known only from the Tibetan translation of the sūtra. Prods Oktor Skjærvø edits fragments from five manuscripts of the *Suvarṇabhāṣottamasūtra* including, for the first time, the beginning of the Central Asian version of the text. Paul Harrison edits fragments of seven manuscripts of the *Vajracchedikā Prajñāpāramitā* preserving an early condensed version similar to a manuscript in the Stein collection. The volume concludes with a specialist treatment of the Tocharian fragments in pressmarks Or.15004, Or.15009, and Or.150010 by Tatsushi Tamai (who also first transliterated the Sanskrit fragments in Or.15009), and a postscript by Seishi Karashima giving a bird’s-eye view of the material here assembled.

The total number of manuscript fragments presented in this volume is 716. For each of them, their editors provide where possible an identification, where applicable a reference to earlier editions, a diplomatic transliteration, and parallel passages in Sanskrit, Chinese, or Tibetan with the phrases

corresponding to those in the fragment helpfully highlighted. It is a testament to the vast knowledge and painstaking work of the editors that for almost all of the fragments, some quite minute, they were able to provide identifications.

The texts represented in these manuscripts run the full range of Central Asian Buddhist Sanskrit literature: mainstream Buddhist sūtras such as the *Bimbisārasūtra* and *Daśottarasūtra*, numerous copies of the *Udānavarga* and *Prātimokṣasūtra*, poetic works such as Aśvaghōṣa's *Buddhacarita*, Mātrceta's *Prasādapratibhodbhava*, and Kumāralāta's *Kalpanāmaṇḍitikā*, and a wide range of Mahāyāna texts that (in addition to those named above) include the *Larger Prajñāpāramitā*, *Saddharmapuṇḍarikasūtra*, *Śūraṅgamasamādhisūtra*, *Gaṇḍavyūha*, *Lalitavistara*, *Pratyutpannabuddhasaṃmukhāvasthisamādhisūtra*, and the first fragment of the *Smaller Sukhāvāṭīyūhasūtra* that has come to light outside Japan. What is missing from the volume is a comprehensive index of identified texts and passages, and the reader has to make do with four separate indices on pp. 66, 101, 331–34, and 539–40. A comprehensive index is now provided by Klaus Wille, "Survey of the Identified Sanskrit Manuscripts in the Hoernle, Stein, and Skrine Collections of the British Library (London)," in *From Birch Bark to Digital Data: Recent Advances in Buddhist Manuscript Research*, ed. Paul Harrison and Jens-Uwe Hartmann, pp. 223–46, Vienna: Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften.

From a linguistic point of view, the fragments preserve many valuable Prakritisms that shed light on the prehistory of Buddhist Hybrid Sanskrit (pp. 638, 667–68). Some of these, such as *sa{m}gārabhena* for *sagāraveṇa* in the *Pratyutpanna* fragment Or.15010/15, point to Gāndhārī dialectal features in particular, and a Gāndhārī background for early Mahāyāna literature is confirmed by the seven Mahāyāna sūtras (including the *Pratyutpanna*) now known in this language. The Crosby *Prātimokṣasūtra* manuscripts, whose rules do not correspond exactly to those of any known Buddhist school (pp. 50–51), similarly bring to mind the Gāndhārī *Prātimokṣasūtra* manuscript in the Bajaur Collection.

The production of the volume is meticulous, with only very occasional typographic glitches and imprecise references ("Skjærvø (2002)" on p. 597 presumably refers to the author's *Khotanese Manuscripts*, and for the cross reference "p. 627" on p. 501 read "p. 628"). The editors and authors have more than maintained the very high philological standards of *BLSF I*, and deserve our gratitude not only for compiling this indispensable tool for any textual scholar of Indian and Central Asian Buddhism, but for making it so readily accessible through the IRIAB and IDP websites.

STEFAN BAUMS
UNIVERSITY OF MUNICH

Rolf Stein's Tibetica Antiqua, with Additional Materials. Translated and edited by ARTHUR P. MCKEON.
Leiden: BRILL, 2010. Pp. xxix + 384. \$185 (cloth).

Rolf Stein, editor Arthur McKeon reminds us, was hailed after his death as "the uncontested master of generations of Tibetologists and Sinologists" (p. xviii). *Rolf Stein's Tibetica Antiqua* in turn stands as an encyclopedic constellation of his painstaking scholarship on the early history, literature, and religions of Tibet and China. Stein became famous through his work on Tibet's epic tradition surrounding the mythic hero-king Gesar of Ling (*Recherches sur l'épopée et le barde au Tibet*; Paris: Bibliothèque de l'Institut des Hautes Études chinoises, 1959), his translation of selections from the life of the "mad saint" Drukpa Kunlé (*Vie et chants de 'Brug-pa Kun-legs, le yogin*; Bonn: Zentralasiatische Studien, 1972), and his comprehensive study of Tibetan history and culture, *La civilisation tibétaine* (Paris: Dunod, 1961, revised 1981; published in English as *Tibetan Civilization*; London: Faber & Faber and Stanford Univ. Press, 1972). The current volume presents English translations of a series of Stein's later work: six articles published sequentially between 1984 and 1992 under the title *Tibetica Antiqua I–VI*. The articles form a natural series and indeed Stein himself intended them to be viewed as a set.

Producing this collection entailed a tremendous amount of work, far beyond the usual editorial process of selection, collation, and reproduction. As McKeon notes, the volume's publication required translating not only Stein's French, but also his Tibetan and Chinese materials. (McKeon acknowl-